

JASMIM ジャーナル（日本音楽即興学会誌） vol. 3

2018年 10月 2日発行

発行者：日本音楽即興学会

目次

巻頭言

日本音楽即興学会編集委員会委員長／若尾 裕 2

論文

**Effect and Significance of Songwriting for People with Mental Disorders: Pilot Trial of Collaboration
Between an Occupational Therapist and a Musician**

精神障害を有する人々へのソングライティングの効果と意義ー作業療法士とミュージシャン
との協働の試みー／Junko TANAKA 3

書評

JAPANOISE／若尾 裕 12

巻頭言

日本音楽即興学会編集委員会委員長 若尾 裕

JASMIM ジャーナル vol. 1 が発刊されたのが2016年1月、vol. 2 が発刊されたのが2018年3月で、この vol. 3 はその同じ年の10月に発刊されることになりました。これは、学会のホームページの JASMIM ジャーナルの最初に書かれている「定期刊行ではありませんが、投稿論文が査読完了され次第刊行する方針にしています。」という方針に従ったもので、今回1本の投稿論文査読が完了しましたので刊行することとなりました。

ここでこの方針について少し述べておきたいと思います。査読論文は大学などアカデミックな世界では重視され、特に博士論文の提出や昇任などで業績として必要とされる場合が多くあります。このとき投稿者にとって刊行までにかかる時間はたいへんおおきな関心事です。と言うのも大きな学会では論文の投稿から査読を経て刊行までに1年ほどかかることはめずらしくないからです。この学会誌のような不定期で臨機応変な方針は、投稿から発刊までできるだけスピーディーに動けるようにしています。そしてこれは小さな学会ゆえの大きな利点だと思います。

今回の論文は初めての英文で、音声資料がリンクされていて参考に聴くことができることも初めての試みです。

まだまだ初めてのことばかりで、とまどいながら仕事を進めるばかりですが、みなさまからの意欲的な投稿をお待ちしております。

論文

Effect and Significance of Songwriting for People with Mental Disorders: Pilot Trial of Collaboration Between an Occupational Therapist and a Musician

精神障害を有する人々へのソングライティングの効果と意義
—作業療法士とミュージシャンとの協働の試み—

Junko TANAKA

田中 順子

Key words

songwriting, musician, occupational therapist, collaboration, mental disorder

ソングライティング、ミュージシャン、作業療法士、協働、精神障害

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to investigate the effect and significance of songwriting through collaboration between an occupational therapist and a musician. The subjects were five women who had been diagnosed with a mental disorder. When setting up the songwriting sessions, attention was paid to the following points: (1) rather than establishing therapeutic goals to improve problems, the only objective for the participants was to enjoy songwriting; (2) the sessions were held in a room outside the hospital; and (3) the musician was responsible for leading the sessions, with the occupational therapist participating as an assistant. In a typical session, the day's activity was carried on as follows; the participants thought up lyrics, the musician improvised melody and harmony to the lyrics, and the lyrics and melodies were repeatedly discussed and corrected until the song was finished. All the participants changed in obviously positive ways. The main reasons for these changes were thought to arise from the cooperative framework involving an occupational therapist and a musician, and the significance of songwriting.

本研究の目的は作業療法士とミュージシャンとの協働によるソングライティングの効果と意義について検討することである。研究対象は精神障害の診断を受けていた5名の女性であった。ソングライティングセッションの設定に当たっては、以下の点に留意した。(1)あえて問題改善のための治療目標を設定せず、参加者がソングライティングを楽しむことのみを目的とした、(2)セッションは病院外の一室で実施した、(3)ミュージシャンがセッションをリードし、作業療法士は補助者として参加した。典型的なセッションは以下のとおりであった。参加者らは歌詞を考え、ミュージシャンがそれにメロディーを付け、歌詞とメロディーは歌が完成するまで繰り返し議論して修正した。活動の結果、参加者すべてが明らかに良い方向へ変化した。その主な理由として、ミュージシャンと作業療法士の協力体制及び、ソングライティングの意義があげられる。

1. Introduction

In countries in which music therapy is generally set as one type of medical treatment, music therapy is regarded exclusively as music therapists' work. In Japan too, the frequency of occupational therapists who do not have professional music skills providing music activities is decreasing except in group musical recreation. However, there are some occupational therapists who are interested in music and like to bring in music to their activities

including myself. This is the report of the musical activity called “songwriting” through collaboration between an occupational therapist and a musician in the mental health field.

“Songwriting” is the general term for the creation of pop and other types of songs. In recent years, writing songs has become a widely used technique in music therapy. Wigram and Baker (2005: 11-23) defined the process of songwriting with clients as an aspect of music therapy as follows:

“The process of creating, notating and/or recording lyrics and music by the client or clients and therapist within a therapeutic relationship to address psychosocial, emotional, cognitive and communication needs of the client”.

According to Silverman (2011, 48: 103-122; 2012, 49: 414-429), a single group songwriting session can be an effective intervention concerning motivation and readiness for treatment in patients on a detoxification unit. From an experiment comparing a group psychoeducational music therapy songwriting session on coping skills with a group psychoeducational session on coping skills as a control, he reported that group songwriting about coping skills could be as effective a psychosocial intervention as traditional talk-based psychoeducation to teach psychiatric inpatients how to proactively manage their illness.

Edgerton (1990, 8: 15-19) also reported that songwriting with adolescents has proven to be an effective technique in developing group cohesiveness, enhancing self-expression, increasing self-esteem, and developing insight into feelings and needs, both of self and of others. Jones (2005, 42: 94-110) found that songwriting and poetry analysis in music therapy was effective in bringing about emotional changes in drug addicts. Baker et al. (2017, 54: 35-54) also analyzed songs composed by psychiatric inpatients who participated in songwriting and reported that the sub-areas of their self-conceptions were repeatedly expressed in these songs.

The main features of these previous studies are that they are descriptions by music therapists in the context of music therapy and that they make use of a medical model that prioritizes the therapeutic goal.

Although the therapeutic value of songwriting has thus been demonstrated, it has not been greatly developed in the practice of occupational therapy. One major reason for this is that songwriting requires specific musical abilities, including the ability to improvise compositions and performance skills. In this project, I attempted to resolve this issue by collaborating with a professional musician.

The general idea of occupational therapy is to use all kinds of activities as a means and for the purpose of medical treatment. To put it another way, it means that the occupational therapist is not specialized in a certain field like a music therapist but is specialized in how to function in a variety of fields of human activities as the medical treatment, with the philosophy of occupation. Furthermore, occupational therapists have occupational therapists' original strengths and viewpoints from the occupation characteristics, such as the power of analysis of activities (Crepeau & Schell 2009: 359-374), moving a group (Schwartzberg 2009: 387-394), play and leisure (Primeau 2009: 633-648), and understanding man comprehensively including the environment (Rogers & Holm 2009: 478-518), etc.

The objective of this study was to investigate the effect and significance of songwriting through collaboration with a musician.

The musician in these sessions was expected not only to be the skilled musician but also a co-worker who could provide a playful background outside the medical context. This is, I think, the characteristic point of this project compared to music therapy. We could expect a different outcome from music therapy in which the therapist and the musician are one person.

2. Methods

2.1 Participants

Among the outpatients who participated in psychiatric occupational therapy, 13 patients hoped to take part in songwriting sessions. The study participants were limited to five women aged 18-46 years who participated \geq 5 times (Table 1).

All five participants had been diagnosed with a mental disorder, and were distressed for reasons such as family problems and physical disease. They all shared the common psychological problems of low confidence and self-esteem. They were also afraid of expressing themselves in front of others and had poor communication skills.

Table 1. Subject attributes

Case ID	Symptoms	Age
A	Interpersonal tension	46
B	Interpersonal tension	39
C	Mood swings	18
D	Anxiety	46
E	Mood swings	45

2.2 Methods

When setting up the songwriting sessions, attention was paid to the following points in order to tone down medical intervention, so that the participants would not think of themselves as patients:

- (1) Rather than establishing therapeutic goals to improve problems, the only objective was for the participants to enjoy songwriting.
- (2) The sessions were held in a room outside the hospital.
- (3) The musician was responsible for leading the sessions, with the occupational therapist participating as an assistant (coworker), rather than as a therapist.

A total of 15 monthly group sessions were held in a meeting room at the university where the author is employed. Each session lasted between 1.5 and 2 hours. The group sessions were attended by the participants, an occupational therapist, and a professional musician. The musician was a pianist with extensive experience in improvisation. The occupational therapist had graduated from a music university and was a trained singer and pianist.

In a typical session, the day's theme was decided, the participants thought up lyrics, the musician improvised melody and harmony, and the lyrics and melodies were repeatedly discussed and corrected until the song was finished. Sometimes some of participants would bring poems they had written to use for the lyrics.

In terms of the division of roles between the musician and the occupational therapist, the musician took the lead in facilitating the sessions, while the occupational therapist acted as an assistant and supported the musician and the participants by leading the singing and speaking up when the participants did not express any suggestions of their own.

Participation in the sessions was voluntary. The participants were asked to write down their thoughts as free descriptions at the end of each session. The sessions were recorded on video and audio to provide analytical

materials for response evaluation.

2.3 Ethical considerations

Approval for this study was granted by the Ethics Committee in Kawasaki University of Medical Welfare (No. 14-040) and consent was obtained from each participant. Confidentiality in anonymity were ensured by using ID in the data analysis process. No risks or discomforts associated with participation in the study were anticipated. The members were informed that a refusal to participate in the study would have no impact on their acceptance in the songwriting.

3. Results

3.1 Group reactions

Each session was attended by 1-4 participants. Initially they did not put forth their own opinions, instead followed to the occupational therapist's suggestions. They also only sang in quiet voices. Gradually, however, they became accustomed to the space and the musician and started to express their feelings openly and sing clearly. During the discussions of lyrics, all the participants, other than Case A, became able to express their own opinions. After a while, they started looking forward to the next session. Except for cases of absence due to poor health or another appointment, all the participants assembled more than 10 minutes before the starting time, with no one arriving late or leaving early. All the members began calling each other by nicknames, including the musician and the occupational therapist. Eventually, all the participants were able to participate in the sessions without becoming tense ([Sound file 1](#)). A common sentiment was "I was really excited. My (our) song came alive."

3.2 Individual reactions

3.2.1 Case A

Case A always wore a mask over her face. In social skills training (SST) at the occupational therapy, she would often refuse to participate in role playing, always responding *Mata kondo* ("Maybe next time") ([Sound file 2](#)) in a quiet voice. Her attitude in the sessions was the same. One day, the musician suggested writing a special song for her, titled "Maybe Next Time!" It was set to the tune of "Coffee Rumba", a song famously sung in Japan. The participants extemporized new lyrics for her, and the musician said that she had to sing the "Maybe next time" part.

For example,

Participant 1: Let's try some role play

A: Maybe next time

Participant 2: Let's sing this song

A: Maybe next time

Participant 3: Let's clean the room

A: Maybe next time

Participant 4: Let's wash the dishes

A: Maybe next time

Although Case A had never been capable of singing audibly before, she was able to sing "Maybe next time" in a quiet voice. She was interested in writing poetry, and when it was suggested that she bring a previously

written poem with her, she responded straight away. Not only that, but she also started writing new poems with her friend Case B to use in the songwriting sessions.

When she ran into the musician on the street, she greeted him clearly in a normal voice, which was a surprising occurrence.

Reflection by Case A

I was really happy to have been able to make up my own song. It was fun to think up the lyrics and perform together. It was a chance to discover something positive about myself, through things like how to communicate through music.

3.2.2 Case B

Although Case B was able to engage in conversations with acquaintances, in situations such as SST, where she might have been the focus of attention, she became nervous and unable to state her own opinions and would refuse to participate in role playing. She felt unable to put what she would like to say into words for fear of offending the other person. However, she participated very actively in the songwriting sessions, writing poems with Case A and stated her own opinions without being nervous.

Reflection by Case B

It was fun to think up lyrics together, with everyone proposing different opinions and thinking “Oh, yes, you could put it like that!” It was fun when everyone brought their own lyrics along, but brainstorming together was also good. Running through the whole song at the end, when I started playing an instrument like the guitar, I was uptight because I thought there was no way I could manage it, but because Zunko-chan [the occupational therapist’s nickname] did it with me, I got through it all right, and I thought that was fun, too.

3.2.3 Case C

Case C was interested in activities such as writing poems and stories, taking photographs, and drawing illustrations.

Her issue, during occupational therapy sessions, was major mood swings. During the free program, she would usually draw illustrations by herself. When her mood was low, although she would respond when spoken to by the occupational therapist, she would almost never communicate voluntarily with other people. When her mood was elevated she would become loquacious, using sexual expressions and abusive language.

She was highly motivated to write poetry as a way of expressing herself in songwriting. She always came up with numerous unique ideas and participated more actively than anyone else. She had once got lost in the university, and when the musician suggested writing a song for her titled “It’s Fine to Get Lost,” she extemporized all the lyrics herself. She participated in all the sessions other than one held during a typhoon.

Reflection by Case C

Two hours went by in a flash!! I really want to write a song about supper next time!

3.2.4 Case D

Case D liked handicrafts and often spent occupational therapy sessions immersed in such activities. She was

able to interact naturally with everyone and could express good opinions without being very nervous. However, she reacted sensitively to others' words and actions, falling into a very dark mood and getting into such a state that the occupational therapist would have to intervene.

In the songwriting sessions, she exhibited particular interest in the lyrics, bringing poems with her that she had been writing on an everyday basis and actively suggesting ideas for lyrics.

Reflection by Case D

I thought I got carried away and talked too much. I like thinking about words, so I kept on talking. Writing songs together is fun. It's better if different people can suggest words. Of course, I'm happy when my words get used.

3.2.5 Case E

Case E was unable to refuse any request from anyone and was constantly running out of energy, because she was too tense, repeatedly falling into depression as a result. She was already very interested in music and knowledgeable about a variety of musical genres. In the songwriting sessions, she actively proposed suggestions for correcting lyrics and composing melodies as well as playing instruments. Being well educated, she would also write poems in English, which she spoke well. One day, she brought with her a poem that she had written, titled *Aosagi* ("Grey Heron") ([Sound file 3](#)). It expressed her feeling that like the grey heron, she wanted to live with her power hidden within her. The musician set this poem to music as a catchy rock song, composed for her in the style of Kiyoshiro Imawano. She said that the tune was exactly right for her poem and liked it enormously.

4. Discussion

I set up these sessions purely to compose songs together, with no intention of setting the therapeutic goal of resolving the participants' problems. Nevertheless, all the participants changed in obviously positive ways: they became able to express themselves voluntarily, brought their own poems with them, sang clearly, and seemingly gained confidence. There were a number of possible reasons for these changes, such as the way the sessions were arranged. In this paper, in line with the purpose of this study, I will discuss two points that may have been particularly influential: the cooperative framework involving an occupational therapist and a musician, and the significance of songs.

4.1 The cooperative framework involving an occupational therapist and a musician

I initially focused on the musician's musical skills. He was capable of extemporaneous compositions of a wide variety of melodies, accompanying them with sophisticated harmonies, and reproducing pre-written music accurately on the piano. These technical skills added color to the music in the songwriting sessions, lifting the mood of participants and making for a lively atmosphere. These skills are absolutely impossible for most occupational therapists to emulate.

The next point was that the musician came up with several interesting and creative ideas, which he proposed in the songwriting sessions. For example, he suggested composing the "Maybe Next Time" song for Case A, whose constant refrain was "Maybe next time," and composing the "It's Fine to Get Lost" song for Case C, who had arrived late because she had lost her way in the university. Because Case C often used abusive language, he tried to incorporate swear words into the song he composed.

He encouraged participants who said they were no good at singing by telling them “You can mutter (*bosoboso*) if you like. Not *bossa nova*, but *boso nova*,” and on the day participants underwent the State-Trait Anxiety Inventory (STAI), he suggested singing the STAI questions set to extemporized melodies.

An occupational therapist might consider the attitude exhibited by Case A of avoiding expressing oneself by always saying “Maybe next time” a problem. The musician, however, said “That’s interesting!” and used it as a unique point in the composition. Unfortunately, most occupational therapists are in the habit of thinking in traditional medical terms and would be unlikely to come up with such a flexible and original idea.

A further point was the non-therapeutic attitude of the musician. When I asked the musician about the points he kept in mind during the songwriting sessions as material for case studies, he answered that he prioritized the following matters: (1) ignoring previous information about participants such as their medical history, and only thinking of them as individuals participating in a musical activity; (2) concentrating solely on how best to direct the musical activity; (3) rather than composing a good song, making sure a song is completed within the time allowed; and (4) rather than attaching too much significance to the finished song, focusing on the process as important.

These priorities indicated that unlike than the therapist’s aim of trying to do something for the participants, the musician was focused solely on the act of composing songs. In place of the “problem-solving orientation” exemplified by the medical model, the musician’s “activity process orientation” was highly significant in relaxing the participants’ stance as patients. This was consistent with what I had expected of the musician.

Turning to the role played by the occupational therapist, while consciously positioning herself as a helper, rather than as a therapist, she was also able to use her professional observation skills to intervene at an early stage when the participants showed signs of fatigue or stress. To help create a light-hearted atmosphere, she also interjected when the musician was talking, deliberately proposing an opposing point of view and making jokes. The participants enjoyed watching this interaction between the musician and the occupational therapist, which they described as “like a comedy double act.” The musician was also not a very good singer, and the occupational therapist, who had studied singing, led the singing while being careful not to drown out the voices of the participants.

4.2 Significance of songwriting

Several participants were highly resistant to expressing themselves in the presence of other people. This was because they were worried about how others would view them, lacked confidence, and were afraid of making mistakes. However, they were able to relax and participate actively in the songwriting sessions. This may have been because of the improvisatory nature of our songwriting format and because the songs themselves, which were completed with the involvement of the participants, were meaningful to them.

Music activities consisting of the reproduction of prewritten music make people nervous, because there is an unspoken pressure to perform them correctly following the score. Songs composed according to whatever inspiration strikes at the time, that is, improvisations, are not subject to any such restrictions. It means that nobody has to practice toward good performance. Their flexibility, in that they can be adapted on the spot to make them easier to sing, ensures that the “experience of failure” can be avoided. This may have been why the participants were able to relax and express themselves. The experience of being liberated from fixed notions of prewritten music may have provided the opportunity for self-liberation, encouraging freer ideas and attitudes.

The songs completed in these songwriting sessions were all written in a style of popular music. This will correspond to the Kawai (2012)'s point which argues that the shared social experience, provided by popular music, gives individuals a sense of belonging to society and that the feeling of security that stems from this generates the trust that enables us to confide in others our own emotions.

4.3 Future subjects

The project of the songwriting this time might be difficult to generalize as a methodology or technique because it deeply depends on the character and the focus of the musician. Therefore, more cases will be required with various kinds of musicians if we seek some of the concepts out of this style of work.

5. Conclusions

In this project, songwriting sessions were arranged in collaboration with a musician as an experimental new format of occupational therapy. These songwriting sessions can be described as a success from the observations of various behaviors of the participants that show that for many of them it become possible to express their feelings openly and sing clearly, and to start to look forward to the next session. Finally, I would like to make the point that the most important meaning of this project would be the bringing of a breath of fresh air to the medical environment from outside through the musician. This can be done with various art fields and artists, and I would like to explore it further.

Acknowledgements

I thank Mr. Yu Wakao, the musician, for his collaboration with every aspect of this study. Mr. Wakao not only collaborated in holding the sessions, but also offered numerous suggestions during the writing of this paper.

This study was supported by the Kawasaki University of Medical Welfare Scientific Research Fund.

References

- Baker, FA., Tamplin, J., MacDonald, RAR., Ponsford, J., Roddy, C., Lee, C. & Rickard, N. (2017). "Exploring the Self through Songwriting: An Analysis of Songs Composed by People with Acquired Neurodisability in an Inpatient Rehabilitation Program," *Journal of Music Therapy*. 54: 35-54.
- Crepeau, EB. & Schell, BAB. (2009). "Analyzing occupations and activity," 359-374. Crepeau, EB., Cohn, ES. & Schell, BAB. ed. <Willard & Spackman's Occupational Therapy 11th ed.> Baltimore: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Edgerton, DC. (1990). "Creative group songwriting," *Music therapy perspectives*. 8: 15-19.
- Jones, DJ. (2005). "A Comparison of Songwriting and Lyric Analysis Techniques to Evoke Emotional Change in a Single Session with People Who are Chemically Dependent," *Journal of Music therapy*. 42: 94-110.
- Kawai, T. (2012). <Songwriting in music therapy: About the character as a vehicle of the emotions.> Doctoral dissertation, Kobe University Graduate school.

- Primeau, L.A. (2009). "Play and Leisure," 633-648. Crepeau, EB., Cohn, ES. & Schell, BAB. ed. <Willard & Spackman's Occupational Therapy 11th ed.> Baltimore: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Rogers, JC. & Holm, MB. (2009). "The occupational therapy process," 478-518. Crepeau, EB., Cohn, ES. & Schell, BAB. ed. <Willard & Spackman's Occupational Therapy 11th ed.> Baltimore: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Schwartzberg, SL. (2009). "Group Process," 387-394. Crepeau, EB., Cohn, ES. & Schell, BAB. ed. <Willard & Spackman's Occupational Therapy 11th ed.> Baltimore: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
- Silverman, MJ. (2011). "The effect of songwriting on knowledge of coping skills and working alliance in psychiatric atients: a randomized clinical effectiveness study," *Journal of Music Therapy*. 48: 103-22.
- Silverman, MJ. (2012). "Effects of group songwriting on motivation and readiness for treatment on patients in detoxification: a randomized wait-list effectiveness study," *Journal of Music Therapy*. 49: 414-429(1).
- Wigram, T. & Baker, F. (2005). "Songwriting-methods, techniques and clinical applications for music therapy clinicians, educators and students," 11-23. Wigram, T. & Baker, F. ed. <Songwriting as therapy.> London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

書評

Japanese - Music at the Edge of Circulation, David Novak, Duke University Press, 2013

若尾 裕

実はこの書はもう少ししたら訳書が出る予定の、私がいま訳出作業中の英文の書です。

日本の音楽のなかで世界的にダントツに評価が高いものはなにか？ それは民俗音楽でも伝統音楽でも、現代音楽でもなく、ノイズ音楽と呼ばれる領域なのです。それは欧米ではジャパノイズと特別な名称まで付けられています。本書はそれについての研究書です。

さて、ノイズミュージックとは何でしょう？ この本でもその定義が試みられているのですが、簡単ではありません。簡単に形容すると暴力的な爆音でノイズが連続する音楽ということになるでしょうか。そのため、もちろんそのファンはさほど多いわけではないのですが、でも確実に熱狂的なファンが一定数存在しています。

ジャパノイズという言い方に対して、当の日本のノイズ・ミュージシャンたちの反応はいろいろです。わざわざそんな呼ばれ方をされたくないというひとたちもいます。どのへんからこの言葉が使われるようになったかは不明ですが、現代の音楽におけるノイズと音楽との関係について包括的に論考した Paul Hegarty: *Noise/Music 2007* (邦訳は「ノイズ／ミュージック」(ポール・ヘガティ著、若尾裕訳、みすず書房、2014)ではすでにジャパノイズと、ノイズの巨匠と言われる秋田昌美についてそれぞれ1章ずつあてられています。いずれにせよ、日本はノイズに関しては特別扱いなのです。もし政治家が、日本の文化のすばらしさを外国にアピールしたいと考えるなら、ノイズミュージックにもちょっぴりでも注目してみてもどうだろうかと言いたいくらいです。

著者デヴィッド・ノヴァックは、そんなジャパノイズの実像にせまろうと、その本場であった関西のシーンに入り込み、独自のフィールド調査を試みました。よく考えてみれば本書は研究書としては、ある意味でとても個性的なもののように見えます。

美しさからはほど遠いこの暴力的な音に惹かれる人がいるのはなぜでしょう？ はたしてこれはいままでの意味での音楽といえるのでしょうか？ ノヴァックはインダストリアルや現代音楽や電子音楽などとの関連など、いろいろ考察を試みますが、結局のところノイズミュージックはいままでの音楽の歴史のなかに位置づけることは容易でないと結論します。私がノイズミュージックが気になってしょうがないのも、このノヴァックの指摘する一種の異物感です。音楽を将来的に見通すときに、ノイズミュージックは何か大きな意味合いを突きつけているような気がしてしょうがないのです。